

1-1-2006

## Teaching Phrase Rhythm through Minuets from Haydn's String Quartets

Ryan McClelland

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcollections.lipscomb.edu/jmtp>

---

### Recommended Citation

McClelland, Ryan (2006) "Teaching Phrase Rhythm through Minuets from Haydn's String Quartets," *Journal of Music Theory Pedagogy*: Vol. 20, Article 1.

Available at: <https://digitalcollections.lipscomb.edu/jmtp/vol20/iss1/1>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by Carolyn Wilson Digital Collections. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of Music Theory Pedagogy by an authorized editor of Carolyn Wilson Digital Collections.

## Teaching Phrase Rhythm through Minuets from Haydn's String Quartets

Ryan McClelland

Recent theoretical research places considerable emphasis on aspects of musical temporality. Theorists have reflected on topics such as the definition of rhythm, the factors that create meter, the relationship between rhythm and meter, the operation of meter at levels above the notated measure (hypermeter), phrase expansion, and rhythmic dissonance. Elements of this research have infiltrated some undergraduate theory textbooks, but many limit discussion of rhythm and meter to an introductory chapter on the fundamentals of notation. Phrase rhythm—the interaction of hypermeter with phrase structure—is of undeniable importance to performers and should be incorporated in the core theory curriculum. The nuances of phrase rhythm can be revealed effectively through a diverse group of excerpts, but I have achieved good learning outcomes from pursuing these ideas in a short unit devoted to several minuets by Haydn. After commenting on relevant theoretical and pedagogical literature, I will sketch a presentation of the key aspects of phrase rhythm—hypermeter, hypermetric reinterpretation, and phrase expansion—with examples drawn from the minuets of Haydn's string quartets. The article will conclude with analyses of three complete minuets to suggest the depth and range of musical understanding that a thorough study of phrase rhythm brings to the theory classroom.

### THEORETICAL APPROACHES

Within the theoretical community there are significant differences of opinion on principles as fundamental as the relationship between rhythm and meter, the extent to which hypermeter is operative, and the nature of musical accents—in addition to considerable variation in terminology. The responsibility rests with the individual instructor to filter these multiple perspectives through one's musical intuitions to create a coherent viewpoint that communicates to students and enriches their engagement with music. My viewpoint leans heavily on the work of Fred Lerdahl and Ray Jackendoff, Carl Schachter, and

William Rothstein.<sup>1</sup> Although the presentation of my pedagogical approach and analytic examples will reveal my debts to these theorists, I will make a few explicit comments on my theoretical positions. Following Lerdahl and Jackendoff, I maintain a conceptual separation of hypermeter from phrase structure (grouping), a clear delineation of metric accents from structural (tonal) accents as well as phenomenal accents, and an explicit approach to understanding metric entrainment. I endorse their notion of a hierarchical metric grid, but I emphasize the more nuanced concept of hypermeter offered by Schachter and Rothstein. Particularly important for me is Rothstein's thorough study of phrase expansion and its interaction with hypermeter. William Caplin also contributes significantly to the study of phrase expansion through his detailed exposition of thematic construction in the music of the late-eighteenth century.<sup>2</sup> My focus on the higher-level constructs of hypermeter and phrase structure privileges those elements towards which I gravitate in listening or in preparing a work for performance.<sup>3</sup>

#### PEDAGOGICAL APPROACHES

Many popular undergraduate theory textbooks do not aim for comprehensiveness and focus almost exclusively on harmony. *Harmony & Voice Leading* by Carl Schachter and Edward Aldwell, for example, offers thorough coverage of pitch structure and relies

---

<sup>1</sup> Fred Lerdahl and Ray Jackendoff, *A Generative Theory of Tonal Music* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1983); Carl Schachter, "Aspects of Meter," *Music Forum* 6 (1987): 1-59, and reprinted in *Unfoldings: Essays in Schenkerian Theory and Analysis*, ed. Joseph N. Straus (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999), 79-120; William Rothstein, *Phrase Rhythm in Tonal Music* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1989).

<sup>2</sup> William Caplin, *Classical Form: A Theory of Formal Functions for the Instrumental Music of Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998).

<sup>3</sup> Both Rothstein and Schachter have written on performance. See Rothstein, "Analysis and the Act of Performance," in *The Practice of Performance: Studies in Musical Interpretation*, ed. John Rink (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 217-40; Schachter, "Chopin's Prelude in D major, Op. 28, No. 5: Analysis and Performance," *Journal of Music Theory Pedagogy* 8 (1994): 27-46; idem, "Playing What the Composer Didn't Write: Analysis and Rhythmic Aspects of Performance," in *Pianist, Scholar, Connoisseur: Essays in honor of Jacob Lateiner*, ed. Bruce Brubaker and Jane Gottlieb (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon, 2000), 47-68. For an application of Rothstein's theoretical ideas to performance, see Marie Rolf and Elizabeth West Marvin, "Analytical Issues and Interpretive Decisions in Two Songs by Richard Strauss," *Intégral* 4 (1990): 67-103.

on the instructor to pursue other topics.<sup>4</sup> Aldwell and Schachter do define the term hypermeasure in chapter 3 (Rhythm and Meter) as “a group of measures that is regulated by meter, so that the whole group sounds like a large measure.” (42) They explain that “the normal organization of measure groups is duple, with strong and weak measures alternating” but do include an exceptional example of three-measure hypermeasures. After this foray into large-scale metric structure, hypermeasure is never again mentioned. In *Tonal Harmony* Stefan Kostka and Dorothy Payne give cursory surveys of phrase structure and form without broaching topics like hypermeter and phrase expansion.<sup>5</sup> In his chapter on phrase structure (chapter 12), Robert Gauldin introduces phrase “extension” and “contraction” and these concepts do return in several of the extended analyses of complete pieces.<sup>6</sup> In the same chapter, he briefly mentions “hypermetric level” as an alternate approach to periodic phrase lengths, but he does not pursue the topic at any length.<sup>7</sup> In a subsequent chapter on rhythm and meter (chapter 18), Gauldin presents the term hypermeasure, but he restricts it to pieces “in very fast tempos” usually notated in 3/4 or 3/8 (meters that he refers to as compound single meters). This is the sole appearance of the term hypermeasure in the text.<sup>8</sup>

The trend among the newest theory texts—those by Steven Laitz, Jane Clendinning and Elizabeth West Marvin, and Miguel Roig-Francolí—is towards greater inclusion of topics other than harmony and voice leading.<sup>9</sup> Hypermeter and phrase expansion are surprisingly absent from Laitz’s generally excellent approach.

---

<sup>4</sup> Carl Schachter and Edward Aldwell, *Harmony & Voice Leading*, 3d edition (Belmont, CA: Thomson, 2003).

<sup>5</sup> Stefan Kostka and Dorothy Payne, *Tonal Harmony with an Introduction to Twentieth-Century Music*, 5th edition (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2004).

<sup>6</sup> Robert Gauldin, *Harmonic Practice in Tonal Music*, 2d edition (New York: Norton, 2004).

<sup>7</sup> Gauldin’s mention of “hypermetric level” in the chapter on phrase structure is a new feature of the second edition.

<sup>8</sup> In the original edition of his text, Gauldin (like Aldwell and Schachter) presented hypermeasure at the end of the chapter on the fundamentals of rhythm and meter.

<sup>9</sup> Jane Piper Clendinning and Elizabeth West Marvin, *The Musician’s Guide to Theory and Analysis* (New York: Norton, 2005); Steven G. Laitz, *The Complete Musician: An Integrated Approach to Tonal Theory, Analysis, and Listening* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003); Miguel A. Roig-Francolí, *Harmony in Context* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2003).

Hypermeter receives its only mention at the outset of a chapter on symmetrical harmony in the nineteenth century (chapter 32); Laitz sets up a dichotomy between the symmetry of melody, meter, and phrase structure and the asymmetry of harmonic and scalar structures in eighteenth-century music. About “music from the Classical period (c. 1750-1820)” Laitz writes:

Metrically, the music of this era moves in predictably proportioned patterns that allows a deeper level of measured periodicity to arise in a phenomenon called hypermeter. And formally, we usually think of Classical musical units at all levels as structures featuring regularly recurring measure lengths such as four-measure phrases and eight-measure periods. (641)

This rhetorical flourish belatedly reveals Laitz’s contention that the temporal dimensions of the repertoire he emphasizes—Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, and Schubert—are so thoroughly periodic and symmetrical that departures from these normative structures need not be addressed even in a comprehensive text. Laitz’s treatment of phrase and period structures contains only a single example of a phrase with a length other than four or eight measures (example 14.15 on page 253). Not considering the aesthetic effects and structural bases of phrases of other lengths misrepresents the richness of phrase rhythm in his core repertoire (except possibly in the case of Schubert). This oversimplification makes students less able to come to terms with music that they are performing. Laitz pays considerable attention to the thought processes of performers and links theoretical concepts with listening and with performance concerns. Yet, his sanitized approach to phrase structure risks students’ perceiving the very disjuncture between theory and performance that most aspects of his text effectively combat.

The treatments of phrase rhythm in the texts by Clendinning and West Marvin and by Roig-Francolí are the most extensive among texts designed for the core theory curriculum. Clendinning and West Marvin devote twelve pages to phrase rhythm in a chapter that comes only three chapters after phrase and period designs were explained and that appears before discussion of applied chords and modulations (other than tonicizations of the dominant). Clearly, Clendinning and West Marvin do not consider phrase rhythm peripheral. Clendinning and West Marvin share

Rothstein's perspectives, even adopting terminology that is not particularly common outside of his work (e.g., prefix and suffix for expansions before the beginning and after the end of a phrase). Clendinning and West Marvin define and demonstrate all of the key elements: hypermeter, elision, metric reinterpretation, and phrase expansion (prefix/suffix and internal expansion). The treatment of each concept is brief, and they choose to emphasize the more easily grasped concepts. There are, for instance, three musical examples of prefixes (two of which are short piano introductions at the start of lieder) and only a single example of an internal phrase expansion.

Roig-Francolí provides a more detailed presentation of phrase expansion and hypermeter. He introduces "phrase extension" already in chapter 7, having introduced phrase and period structures in the previous chapter. Roig-Francolí presents "initial extensions" and "cadential extensions" but appropriately devotes more space to "internal extensions." His treatment of internal expansions focuses on phrases that are immediately repeated with inserted material, or parallel periods in which the consequent phrase is longer than the antecedent phrase. Particularly noteworthy is his study of an expanded consequent phrase in the last movement of Mozart's Piano Concerto in D minor, K. 466 (examples 7.14 and 7.15 on page 275). Roig-Francolí provides two recompositions of Mozart's nine-measure consequent phrase, one that shows a four-measure prototype and a second version that gives an intermediate six-measure version. Four chapters later, Roig-Francolí explains hypermeter and embarks on an elaborate exploration of the interaction between hypermetric accents and the emphases that result from tonal motion and formal initiation/completion (what he terms tonal, harmonic, and structural accents). An important omission from Roig-Francolí's text, however, is hypermetric reinterpretation (as frequently occurs at phrase elisions).

Roig-Francolí's handling of hypermeter merits additional comment. Unlike Clendinning and West Marvin (and Rothstein, and my pedagogical approach), Roig-Francolí does not use Arabic numerals to indicate hypermeter. Instead, he employs the accent and unaccent symbols from prosodic analysis seemingly to show that

patterns of weak and strong beats are reproduced at multiple levels of the metric hierarchy.<sup>10</sup> Students, however, should be accustomed to feeling accentual differences when counting or conducting “1-2-3-4” within a measure, and they can transfer this experience directly to hypermeter. I always introduce students to hypermeter by asking them to conduct (or count) along with a recording and subsequently showing them the score, which reveals that they were experiencing notated measures as beats. I would find it more difficult to maintain that direct experience of hypermeter through a network of accent and unaccent symbols. Besides, many teachers of performance intone measure numbers as students play to guide them towards effective overall shaping of phrases, and hypermeter is not unrelated to that technique.

The real motivation for Roig-Francolí’s hypermetric notation only becomes apparent several pages later in his discussion of the first eight measures of the third movement of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony; Roig-Francolí’s analysis (example 11.9 on page 358) is reproduced in Example 1. The arrows above mm. 1 and 8 indicate “structural accents” which correspond to moments of initiation and arrival (cadence). The accent and unaccent symbols represent the hypermeter, and the brackets indicate the hypermeasures. Roig-Francolí writes, “We notice immediately that metric accents fall on measures 2, 4, 6, and 8, while the odd-numbered measures, in this case, are clearly unaccented.” Roig-Francolí permits a hypermeasure to have an accentual profile different from a measure; he explains that the normative organization of a four-measure hypermeasure is “strong-weak-strong-weak” whereas this Beethoven hypermeasure has a “weak-strong-weak-strong” accentual profile.<sup>11</sup> This is a conceptualization of hypermeter that differs from Lerdahl and

---

<sup>10</sup> Roig-Francolí’s examples are visually reminiscent of those in Grosvenor Cooper and Leonard B. Meyer, *The Rhythmic Structure of Music* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1960). Cooper and Meyer’s strong and weak accents, though, are not hypermetric accents; within the measure, their accents generally correspond closely to metric accents but as they approach the level of the phrase the accents reflect structural events like cadences.

<sup>11</sup> Roig-Francolí consistently uses the same accent symbol for the two strong beats within a four-measure hypermeasure, even though one doesn’t experience these moments as equally strong (just as one doesn’t experience the first and third beats within 4/4 meter as equally strong). In his initial presentation of meter, though, Roig-Francolí does note that in quadruple meters beat 3 is weaker than beat 1, despite the fact that his diagrams in that chapter also use the same accent symbol for both beats.

Example 1 - Roig-Francolí's analysis of Beethoven, Symphony No. 5, III, mm. 1-8

Jackendoff, Rothstein, Schachter, and my idea of hypermeter. If one holds as axiomatic that a four-measure hypermeasure begins with a strong beat, then this excerpt is understood as a conflict between grouping and hypermeter. Measures 1-4 and 5-8 (the brackets in Roig-Francolí's example) represent groups (subphrases), while the first hypermeasure begins only at m. 2.<sup>12</sup> In the specific case of the opening of the third movement from Beethoven's Fifth Symphony, though, the location of hypermetric accents may not be quite as unambiguous as Roig-Francolí asserts (despite the fact that Schenker and Tovey agree on the hypermetric strength of the second measure). The ascending quarter-note upbeat from scale degree 5 to scale degree 1 is a standard minuet/scherzo beginning, and hearing an extended upbeat requires one to adduce sufficient elements in this opening to reject this stylistically common schema.

The scrutiny of this example from Roig-Francolí's text offers tangible proof of the divergent conceptions of hypermeter among theorists. It also highlights one of the challenges that authors of introductory textbooks grapple with. A more sophisticated treatment of any subject inherently leads to a less neutral presentation, which may not adapt as easily to the approaches of a broad spectrum of instructors. For this instructor, none of the textbooks designed for the core curriculum has a completely satisfactory approach to phrase rhythm. I will now outline one that I find effective.

<sup>12</sup> This is also the interpretation advanced by Lerdahl and Jackendoff (see page 34 of *A Generative Theory of Tonal Music*). This view is implicit in the readings of this passage by Tovey and Schenker. Both Tovey and Schenker use Arabic numerals, and place a "1" in the second measure. Tovey places a "4" in the first measure while Schenker labels it as an upbeat. See Donald Francis Tovey, *Essays in Musical Analysis*, vol. 1 (London: Oxford University Press, 1935), 42; Heinrich Schenker, *Free Composition*, trans. and ed. Ernst Oster (New York: Longman, 1979), figure 146, no. 5.



## CURRICULAR DESIGN AND REPERTOIRE

Despite the importance of hypermeter, I do not believe that it should be introduced at the start of theory instruction with the fundamental principles of metric organization and rhythmic notation. Students need to internalize meter first and later transfer that understanding to a higher level of musical structure. I also delay teaching hypermeter until after phrase and period organization so that students focus on tonal and melodic structures in locating and describing phrases and periods. Introducing hypermeter before students have some security in finding cadences and phrase boundaries might have the unintended consequence of encouraging a measure-counting approach to phrase identification. I prefer to introduce hypermeter around the same time as applied chords and diatonic modulation, as students begin to consider longer stretches of music. On the other hand, I mention phrase expansion soon after developing the concepts of phrases and periods and outlining typical configurations of melodic subphrases within phrases and periods. I explore phrases with irregular lengths and suggest how they may relate to a more common phrase length, but this is accomplished without mention of hypermeter.

At some later point in the curriculum—my preference is when students begin to study form—it is crucial to revisit phrase structure and hypermeter to consider their interactions, which, following Rothstein, I collectively refer to as phrase rhythm. The balance of this article offers an approach to teaching phrase rhythm through minuets by Haydn. Why minuets from Haydn string quartets? The music of Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven offers an excellent starting point for examining the interaction of phrase design and metric structure. I have singled out Haydn string quartet minuets for several reasons. First, Haydn minuets are short enough that it is possible to work with complete pieces rather than excerpts.<sup>13</sup> Second, for the majority of these minuets, students can understand the tonal structure once applied chords and modulation to closely related keys have been presented; among the fifty-seven minuet movements in Haydn's mature string quartets (Op. 9 to Op. 77),

---

<sup>13</sup> Frequently, I do examine only the minuet section or only the trio section of a movement. In Haydn's practice, the minuet and trio components rarely share similar structural features. A movement with significant shared material such as the minuet-trio from Op. 50, No. 5 represents the exception rather than the norm.

fewer than half include advanced harmonic materials (augmented sixths, Neapolitan sixth, mixture, modulation to distantly related keys). Whether this is an important consideration depends on curricular design. I prefer to start the study of form before completing chromatic harmony to demonstrate the breadth of analysis earlier in the curriculum. Even in a curriculum that begins with an exclusive concentration on four-part writing and harmonic analysis and culminates in a study of form, though, minuet-trio form is typically one of the first forms encountered. A third motivation for using minuets from string quartets is to develop score-reading skill. Finally, Haydn's minuets possess a wide array of phrase designs and hypermetric organizations. The minuet and the similar *passepied* were the only eighteenth-century dances whose steps spanned two measures of the notated meter. Thus, in minuets composed for dancing, of which Haydn penned many, the music consistently projects two-measure hypermeter. In his art minuets, Haydn sometimes remains close to functional minuets, but often wittily engages convention by exploring more varied phrase design and hypermetric organization.<sup>14</sup> This is especially the case in the minuets he wrote for string quartet. Focusing on a unified group of pieces allows students to assimilate thoroughly the conventions of style and genre and thereby become more sensitive to the rich dialogue with convention that animates the works of Viennese classicism.

---

<sup>14</sup> Gretchen Wheelock has written on Haydn's play with conventions, including a study of several minuets from his symphonies. Although Wheelock focuses on Haydn's incorporation of elements from other genres (like canon or country dance), she does note a couple of instances of unexpected delays and expansions. See Gretchen A. Wheelock, *Haydn's Ingenious Jesting with Art: Contexts of Musical Wit and Humor* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1992), esp. 55-89.

## PHRASE RHYTHM

Minuets that have periodic hypermeter and symmetrical phrase structure provide an appropriate starting point. Examples 2 and 3 give the scores to the first part of two such pieces.<sup>15</sup> Although both have four-measure hypermeter, they have different relationships between these hypermeasures and phrase lengths. Throughout Op. 20, No. 6 the phrases are four measures in length while throughout

Example 2 - Op. 20, No. 6 (minuet), mm. 1-8

Example 3 - Op. 33, No. 4 (scherzo), mm. 1-8

<sup>15</sup> Other movements that adhere strictly to four-measure hypermeter and have phrases that are congruent with that hypermeter are: Op. 9, No. 5 (minuet and trio), Op. 20, No. 4 (minuet and trio, though much syncopation in the minuet), Op. 20, No. 6 (minuet), Op. 33, No. 3 (trio), Op. 33, no. 4 (scherzo), Op. 33, No. 5 (trio), Op. 33, No. 6 (trio), Op. 42 (trio), Op. 50, No. 1 (minuet), Op. 50, No. 3 (trio), Op. 54, No. 1 (trio), Op. 64, No. 2 (trio), Op. 64, No. 6 (trio), Op. 71, No. 2 (trio), Op. 76, No. 3 (trio), and Op. 76, No. 6 (trio). (Note that in the Op. 33 quartets, Haydn uses the designation scherzo rather than minuet, but these scherzos do not present a significant change in style.)

Op. 33, No. 4 the phrases are eight measures long (and each is in sentence design!).<sup>16</sup> Since these two movements proceed at almost identical tempos, they provide a vivid reminder that phrase length really does affect the sound of a piece. In both pieces, the pacing of tonal events within hypermeasures is quite unremarkable. The purpose of examples like Op. 20, No. 6 and Op. 33, No. 4 is to provide students with a baseline for comparison with subsequent pieces.

Assuming that students were exposed to phrase expansion soon after phrase and period structures were introduced, they are ready to consider how hypermeter interacts with phrase expansion. Consider the minuet from Op. 20, No. 1 (shown in Example 4). In this minuet, four-measure hypermeter persists throughout. Two moments are of interest. First, as frequently occurs, a stasis on dominant harmony precedes the thematic rounding. The thematic rounding could have begun as early as the anacrusis to m. 21; mm. 21-24 expand the previous tonal arrival on the dominant (mm. 21-24 are a post-cadential expansion, or suffix). Adopting Rothstein's terminology, I make a distinction between surface hypermeter and underlying hypermeter. Measures 21-24 are part of the surface hypermeter but are not part of the underlying hypermeter; the quality of musical time within these measures is different—less directed—than that of the surrounding measures. The hypermetric expansion in mm. 21-24 does not disrupt the periodicity of the surface hypermeter, since it introduces exactly four additional measures; I will give instances below of hypermetric expansions that do disturb the periodicity of the surface hypermeter. A second significant moment in this minuet occurs after m. 36. Measures 25 to 32 recapitulate the music of mm. 1-8, and m. 33 begins a further repetition of this material. At m. 36, the expected  $A\flat$  in the melody and  $V_5^6$  harmony are dramatically displaced by  $A\sharp$  and an applied  $vii_5^{o6}$  chord. This surprising harmony is prolonged throughout the following two measures until

---

<sup>16</sup> I reserve the term phrase for a segment of music that makes a complete tonal motion and ends with a cadence. Caplin, idiosyncratically, employs the term differently and calls a sentence's first four measures a phrase. In his usage, a phrase is a "functionally neutral term of grouping structure and refers, in general, to a discrete group approximately four measures in length." (260, n5) Caplin's usage goes against the sense of completion that musicians intuitively associate with the concept of phrase.

Allegretto

Hypermeter: 1 2 3 4 1 2 3 4

9

16

23 Rounding

*cresc.* *f* *p*

3 4) 1 2 3 4 1 2

Example 4 - Op. 20, No. 1 (minuet)

Example 4 - Op. 20, No. 1 (minuet) *Continued*

it resolves to dominant harmony. This three-measure prolongation of a single—and chromatic—harmony, however, does not correlate with a phrase or hypermetric expansion. Like mm. 1-8 and 25-32, mm. 33-40 consist of a single eight-measure phrase that contains two four-measure hypermeasures. The expressive effect of mm. 33-40 changes not only because of the unexpected harmony in m. 36 but also because of the lack of harmonic and rhythmic motion at the start of m. 37. Measures 33-40 are no longer articulated into two four-measure subphrases, but their hypermetric structure remains the same. An unusually long harmony or a thematic repetition does not always signify expansion; as always in musical analysis, context must be evaluated.

The minuet movements from Haydn's string quartets provide many other instances of hypermetric expansions that maintain the periodicity of the surface hypermeter. Other examples of an expanded fourth hyperbeat<sup>17</sup> at the dominant arrival before the

<sup>17</sup> A hyperbeat is a beat in a hypermeasure; hyperbeats correspond to notated downbeats. "Fourth hyperbeat" thus refers to the downbeat of the fourth measure within a hypermeasure. In some contexts, I prefer the term "hyperdownbeat" over "first hyperbeat" but these terms are synonymous.

thematic rounding include the minuets of Op. 55, No. 3 (mm. 21-24), Op. 64, No. 2 (mm. 23-26), and Op. 76, No. 4 (mm. 25-28). Occasionally, this fourth hyperbeat is expanded by more than four additional measures; an eight-measure expansion occurs in the minuet of Op. 64, No. 4 (mm. 17-24), and a twelve-measure expansion in the trio of Op. 50, No. 6 (mm. 45-56). Expansions of other hyperbeats occasionally, but rarely, leave the surface hypermeter strictly periodic. An example of a second hyperbeat that is expanded by four additional measures occurs in the last phrase of the trio from Op. 50, No. 4 (mm. 62-66). In the minuet from Op. 77, No. 2, a first hyperbeat is similarly expanded (mm. 5-9). Sometimes an expansion that preserves the periodicity of the surface hypermeter results from an expansion of more than one hyperbeat. The final eight measures of the trio of Op. 50, No. 6 (mm. 79-86) are an expansion of a four-measure unit stated earlier (mm. 69-72). By comparing the expanded version with the earlier passage, one observes that the second hyperbeat is expanded by three measures and the third hyperbeat is expanded by one measure.

Before considering more complex interactions of phrase structure and hypermeter, I introduce the crucial concept of hypermetric reinterpretation.<sup>18</sup> The most frequent type of reinterpretation is a fourth hyperbeat that also acts as the downbeat of the next hypermeasure. Hypermetric reinterpretation results from overlap in the phrase structure, either at the level of the phrase itself or between constituent subphrases. In the minuet genre, overlap and reinterpretation are much more common between subphrases than between phrases. The minuet from Op. 42 (shown in Example 5) illustrates. The first eight measures establish four-measure hypermeter. In the second part, the thematic rounding begins at m. 16, and it is preceded by a seven-measure prolongation of the dominant. Measures 9-12 take up the thematic material of mm. 1-4, but the eighth notes in m. 12 become the basis for a new two-measure idea. In other words, at the subphrase level m. 12 groups both with the preceding and following measures. The seven-measure span that precedes the thematic rounding consists of two

---

<sup>18</sup> Rothstein uses the term “metrical reinterpretation” but I prefer hypermetric reinterpretation since it is more accurate: the reinterpretation occurs at a hypermetric level, not a metric one. In any case, I find “reinterpretation” much more connected to musical experience—and thus more pedagogically valuable—than Lerdaahl and Jackendoff’s “metrical deletion.”

overlapped hypermeasures. Following Rothstein's notation, I have shown the hypermetric reinterpretation with 4=1 in m. 12. Despite the considerable length of the dominant prolongation, there is no phrase expansion here. Haydn could have written a four-measure prolongation of dominant harmony, but not with the melodic idea that he selected. To propose a four-measure prototype for this

Allegretto

Hypermeter: 1 2 3 4 1

6 2 3 4 1 2 3

12 4=1 2 3 4 1 Rounding

Example 5 - Op. 42 (minuet), mm. 1-16



passage would necessarily remove essential components of the tonal structure of this passage. As soon as the first violin transposes the A-G#-A-B figure up by step, the outcome of the melodic motion in the first hypermeasure becomes D, which is a dissonant fourth above the bass. Since the essential melodic motion in mm. 9-11 is one pitch per measure (A, B, then C#), a quick resolution of D to C# within m. 12 would not be convincing at such an important moment in the form. The dominant prolongation must continue past its fourth measure. An exquisite detail of Haydn's version

29 Rounding

Hypermeter: 1 2 3 4 1 2 3 4 1 2

39

49

2 3 4) 1 2 (1 2) 3 4

Example 6 - Op. 50, No. 3 (minuet), mm. 29-57

McClelland: Teaching Phrase Rhythm through Minuets from Haydn's String Quartet  
 TEACHING PHRASE RHYTHM THROUGH MINUETS

Allegro

Hypermeter: 1 2 3 4 parenthesis

7 1 2 3 4 1 2

13 3 4 (OR 1 2 parenthesis 3 4 5) f

20 Rounding (=mm.1-10) f

6) parenthesis 1 2

Example 7 - Op. 33, No. 2 (scherzo), mm. 1-26

is the maintenance of equal pacing of structural melodic pitches, though at a slower speed; D is the essential melodic tone in mm. 12-13 and it resolves to C $\sharp$  in mm. 14-15.

The hypermetric reinterpretation in the Op. 42 minuet occurs in a passage that does not involve a phrase expansion, but frequently a reinterpretation coincides with the onset of a hypermetric expansion. Example 6 provides the last phrases of the minuet from Op. 50, No. 3. The thematic rounding starts at m. 37 and follows the course of the first part of the minuet until m. 48. At m. 48, the expected perfect authentic cadence is replaced by a deceptive progression. Measure 48 is a fourth hyperbeat, and marks the conclusion of the phrase's underlying hypermeter. Measures 48 to 51 clearly possess a 2 + 2 construction; in other words, m. 48 is also a new beginning, but it is different in kind from the other beginnings of phrase units in the minuet. Measures 48 to 51 are most sensitively viewed as an expansion of the deceptive motion in m. 48. There is a 4=1 hypermetric reinterpretation in m. 48, but the new hyperdownbeat is only part of the surface hypermeter, not part of the underlying hypermeter.

In the phrase expansions discussed thus far, the surface hypermeter has remained strictly periodic or has been periodic except for one hypermetric reinterpretation. With many phrase expansions, the surface hypermeter does not remain periodic; only the underlying hypermeter does. Echo effects provide a pedagogically expedient demonstration of this principle. The second movement from the "Joke" quartet, reproduced in Example 7, is a good choice. The echo measures are sharply delineated by softer dynamics and by changes in instrumentation; they are obviously parenthetical to the primary musical discourse.<sup>19</sup> Particularly wonderful is the effect at m. 24 where a parenthetical passage ends with an E $\flat$  major triad. The structural return to E $\flat$  major harmony clearly occurs only at the following measure due to the obvious

---

<sup>19</sup> Some may object to my inference of a one-measure echo in mm. 15-16 on the basis that hearing this music as an echo precludes hearing mm. 15-16 and 17-18 as balanced pairs of measures. Whether mm. 15-20 represent an expanded four-measure unit or a true six-measure unit is not entirely clear. I prefer the former interpretation not because it strictly preserves the periodicity of the underlying hypermeter, but because that hearing responds to the phrase's echo effect, which continues this prominent feature of this movement.

differentiation of parenthetical elements, but Haydn plays with the listener's expectation for tonal return at this moment in the form.<sup>20</sup>

Echo effects are a convincing illustration of our ability to suspend and resume hypermetric counting in response to musical cues. Other techniques for expanding phrases such as harmonic deceleration, repetition of a subphrase, and tonal digression can also break the periodicity of the surface meter but allow an underlying hypermeter to remain accessible. In Op. 33, No. 2, a harmonic deceleration marks the arrival on dominant harmony at m. 19, resulting in a one-measure expansion of a fourth hyperbeat. The last phrase of the minuet from Op. 50, No. 3 (refer back to Example 6) shows repetition of a subphrase expanding the phrase from four to six measures. The hypermetric analysis hears through the expansion to the underlying four-measure hypermeter. Even though the expansion does not establish its own periodic surface hypermeter, I show Arabic numerals beneath the expansion in mm. 54-55 of Example 6 to signify a rehearing of the first and second hyperbeats. With a parenthesis, the musical cues are sufficient to suspend hypermetric counting until after the parenthesis; with an expansion resulting from repetition, the cognitive response is more like redundant counting than the absence of hypermetric counting. It bears reiterating that the hypermetric role of repetition is entirely dependent on context. In an eight-measure sentence, a two-measure subphrase is immediately repeated, and that repetition is essential to the phrase and to the underlying hypermeter. In the example from Op. 50, No. 3, however, the two-measure repetition produces a six-measure phrase in a minuet built entirely from four-measure hypermeasures.

The passages above have demonstrated interactions between phrase structure and hypermeter, and I have emphasized the impact that phrase expansion has on hypermeter. All of the minuets presented thus far strongly privilege four-measure units. Many of Haydn's minuets explore other constructions, although the four-measure phrase and four-measure hypermeter should be seen as normative for the late-eighteenth-century minuet (and a great deal

---

<sup>20</sup> Another minuet that employs echo effects is Op. 71, No. 1. Unlike Op. 33, No. 2, in the minuet of Op. 71, No. 1 the thematic rounding is recomposed without echo effects. In an especially wonderful way, Haydn, integrates most of the pitch content of one of the parentheses into the newly composed final four-measure phrase (compare mm. 11-12 with mm. 37-38 in Op. 71, No. 1).

of other music). Four-measure structures are normative not only because of the statistical frequency with which the minuet repertoire follows these conventions but also because many of the minuets that depart from them seem to do so in a deliberately willful manner. I will now explore three minuets in greater detail to demonstrate musical insights that can emerge from a thorough study of phrase rhythm. The minuet from Op. 74, No. 1 privileges four-measure units, although its use of hypermetric reinterpretation and phrase expansion is pervasive and complex. The minuets from Op. 74, No. 2 and Op. 64, No. 6 play off the conventions of four-measure phrases and hypermeasures, and an understanding of these minuets profits greatly from the awareness of stylistic norms absorbed from the previous examples.

### THREE ANALYSES

The minuet from Op. 74, No. 1 (score in Example 8) reinforces the concept of hypermetric reinterpretation, and it also features phrase expansions that do not sustain a periodic surface hypermeter. The music immediately establishes four-measure hypermeter through the abrupt changes in melodic material, rhythm, and texture at m. 5. After this clear separation between the first two hypermeasures, the first part of the minuet connects its remaining hypermeasures through reinterpretation. Students looking at the score are tempted to opt for a superficially simpler understanding: viewing mm. 5-7 and 8-10 as three-measure hypermeasures. Not only are three-measure hypermeasures atypical of the genre, but they parse the harmonic progressions inappropriately. The chords in mm. 7 and 10 are both dominant sevenths, and one cannot properly feel their tonal resolutions without continuing the hypermeasure into the following measure. Playing this passage at the keyboard with slight pauses at the ends of mm. 7 and 10 convinces students of the need for

McClelland: Teaching Phrase Rhythm through Minuets from Haydn's String Quartet  
 TEACHING PHRASE RHYTHM THROUGH MINUETS

Allegretto

Hypermeter: 1 2 3 4 1 2 3 4=1 2

10

3 4 (=1 2 3 4) 1 2 3

18

4 1 2 3 4 1 2 3 4

27 Rounding

1 2 3 4 1 2 3

Example 8 - Op. 74, No. 1 (minuet)

35

4 1 2 3 4=1 2 (3 4=1 2) 3

45

cre - scen - do *f*

cre - scen - do *f*

cre - scen - do *f*

4 ----- 1 2 3 4  
 (=1 2 3 4)

53

1 2 3 parenthetical insertion 4 -----

Example 8 - Op. 74, No. 1 (minuet) *Continued*

continuity and thus the presence of hypermetric reinterpretations in mm. 8 and 11. The analysis in Example 8 takes mm. 11-14 as a four-measure suffix to the phrase, which means that the fourth hyperbeat in the underlying hypermeter occurs at m. 11 and is expanded. One might consider mm. 11-14 as integral to the phrase since they do perform the essential function of giving G (rather than B) prominent placement in the upper line. Measures 11-14 cannot stand as an independent phrase, but I prefer hearing these measures as a suffix rather than as a continuation of the previous phrase because of their lack of harmonic motion and their rhetoric.

Instead of growing smoothly out of the preceding material, they draw on a conventionalized closing gesture, undercutting—even mocking—the cantilena of the previous six measures.

The second part begins with a sequence whose units coincide with four-measure hypermeasures. Dominant harmony returns at m. 27 and also forms the basis of a hypermeasure. The fourth hyperbeat is expanded by a single measure through the repetitive oscillations of the first violin; the last four eighth notes of m. 30 could have been F<sup>#</sup>—G—F<sup>#</sup>—D (or there could have been two beats of silence at the end of m. 30). The thematic rounding follows the course of the minuet's opening until m. 40 where Haydn enharmonically reinterprets C<sup>#</sup> as D<sup>b</sup>. This spawns a tonal digression towards  $\flat$ VI (which was the structural underpinning of mm. 15-26), and this extra tonal content expands the predominant portion of the phrase until the dominant arrival at m. 45. The remoteness of the harmony is not the only indication of an expansion; mm. 39-45 are based on the harmonic progression and voice leading of mm. 8-11. Example 9 clarifies the connection between these two locations. Playing these harmonic reductions at the keyboard convinces students that the distinction between surface and underlying hypermeters is a valid, albeit sometimes subtle, distinction. After this chromatic digression, Haydn brings back the opening thematic idea with its tonal and rhythmic solidity. This time there is no motivic, rhythmic, or textural change at the end of the four-measure hypermeasure. The continuity between mm. 52-53 suggests that the opening four-measure unit will finally generate a cohesive eight-measure phrase and carry the minuet to a rousing close. Instead, at the moment when the perfect authentic cadence is expected, Haydn interjects three measures based on the material from the suffix at the end of the first part of the minuet. These three measures are a parenthetical

(a) Measures 8-11                      (b) Model for measures 39-45                      (c) Measures 39-45

1 2 3 4                      1 2 3 4                      1 2 (3 4=1) 2) 3 4

I 6 IV<sup>5</sup> <sup>#5</sup> 6 V<sup>6</sup> / V                      I 6 iv<sup>5</sup> <sup>b6</sup> vii<sup>o7</sup> / V                      I 6 iv<sup>5</sup> <sup>b6</sup> V<sup>7</sup> /  $\flat$ VI  $\flat$ III vii<sup>o7</sup> IV vii<sup>o7</sup> / V

(ii<sup>6</sup>)                      ( $\flat$ II<sup>6</sup>)                      (IV<sup>6</sup>/ $\flat$ VI)

Example 9 - Harmonic reductions of mm. 8-11 and 39-45



Allegro

Hypermeter: 1 2 3 4 1 2 3 4

9

1 2 3 4 (4) 1

15 Rounding

2 3 4 1 2 3 4

22

Surface hypermeter: 3 4

5 6 ..... 1 2 3 ..... p

Example 10 - Op. 74, No. 2 (minuet)

29

35

1 2 3 4 1 cresc. 2

4 1 2 3 4

Example 10 - Op. 74, No. 2 (minuet) *Continued*

insertion, and a particularly jarring one with the strongly projected hemiola in mm. 56-57.<sup>21</sup> Balance is restored in the final two measures with a gesture that not only recalls the final two measures of the first part but is a stock closing gesture in the Classical style.

A minuet that plays off the convention of the four-measure phrase is Op. 74, No. 2 (score in Example 10). The first part establishes four-measure hypermeter quite strongly through the parallelism of mm. 1 and 2 with mm. 5 and 6. The phrase structure, though, consists of a single phrase rather than two balanced four-measure phrases. An eight-measure phrase is not inherently unusual, but this one arises unexpectedly. The chromatic chord in m. 4 displaces an impending half cadence at the last instant; comparison of the score with the recomposition given in Example 11 shows how close the music comes to achieving a half cadence in m. 4.

The thematic rounding follows up on the first violin's C<sup>#</sup> and the

<sup>21</sup> Rothstein gives these three measures as an example of parenthetical insertion in *Phrase Rhythm in Tonal Music*, 89. His interpretation of hypermeter in mm. 49-60 is the same as mine.

Example 11 - Recomposition of mm. 1-8 from Op. 74, No. 2

missing half cadence. The C<sup>#</sup> arrives at m. 21, which is the fourth measure of the rounding, but the harmonic support is altered. The C<sup>#</sup> is no longer given consonant support; it is dissonant against a supertonic harmony. This harmony, in turn, leads to the dominant, providing the half cadence that was previously denied. The thematic rounding does consist of antecedent and consequent phrases, but neither is four measures long: the antecedent phrase comprises mm. 18 to 24, and the consequent phrase mm. 25 to 37.

I have indicated my hypermetric reading on the score, although other interpretations are possible and would form the basis for class discussion. I will discuss a couple of aspects of my analysis. First, the dominant arrival in mm. 23-24 acts as a single hyperbeat. These two notated measures are heard as parallel to m. 21; the extended notated durations and the fermatas represent a composed-out *ritardando* and are not perceived as metric. Second, a weak hyperbeat in the underlying hypermeter coincides with a strong hyperbeat in the surface hypermeter at the cadence that ends the consequent phrase (m. 37). Given the obvious duple patterning in the previous six measures, m. 37 is a strong beat in the surface hypermeter. Yet, in the underlying prototype, the cadence would have occurred at m. 28, a fourth hyperbeat. I understand the hypermetric strength of m. 37 as a surface feature that adds emphasis to an arrival that is essentially hypermetrically weak. Although it is not impossible to have consecutive hyperdownbeats, hearing the different structural levels at play makes the initiation of a codetta in mm. 38-41 less metrically disjunct and subtly shapes how performers nuance the cadence at m. 37.

McClelland: Teaching Phrase Rhythm through Minuets from Haydn's String Quartet  
 TEACHING PHRASE RHYTHM THROUGH MINUETS

Allegretto

Hypermeter: 1 2 3 4 5 6

7

1 2 3 4 5 6 1 2

15 Rounding

3 4 1 2 3 4 1

22

2 3 4 1 2 3 4

Example 12 - Op. 64, No. 6 (minuet)

29

*f* *p* *f* *p*

1 2 3 4 1 2 3 4

Example 12 - Op. 64, No. 6 (minuet) *Continued*

The minuet from Op. 64, No. 6 is in some ways simpler than either of the previous two minuets, but it is a minuet where four-measure units are initially less privileged (score in Example 12). The first part consists of two parallel phrases, each six measures long. In principle, these twelve measures admit several possible hypermetric interpretations. It would be possible to posit four-measure hypermeter, but that hypermeter would cut across the phrase structure. In this repertoire, phrase structure has a decisive impact on large-scale meter; m. 7 is hypermetrically comparable to m. 1. This suggests two alternatives: a pair of six-measure hypermeasures or a pair of expanded four-measure hypermeasures. The surface hypermeter is certainly in six-measure units with pairs of measures grouped triply at the level of the phrase. The question is whether these six-measure units are basic structures or whether they represent expansions of underlying four-measure spans. In this composition, there is no definitive answer. Through elimination of the repetition in m. 2 (and m. 8) and the embellishing chord in m. 3 (and m. 9), a syntactically correct four-measure prototype emerges, a possibility shown in Example 13. Determining whether this prototype is the basis for Haydn's version or represents, in effect, a different piece of music is an aesthetic judgment. Perhaps the most productive conceptualization is to recognize both of these perspectives with the understanding that in a single performance or mental rehearsing only one of these interpretations is fully available. It is less stimulating to maintain that meter above the two-measure level is not operative. There is enough periodicity to promote some type of higher-level metric hearing. Not directing any attention to these longer spans misses the interplay between duration and tonal function at the fourth measure in each phrase; mm. 4 and 10 have the rhythmic slowing associated with cadence

Allegretto

Hypermeter: 1 2 3 4 1 2 3 4

Example 13 - Hypothetical recomposition of first part (mm. 1-12)

(which one expects in this style in a fourth measure) but they have harmonies that are inappropriate as tonal goals. Experiencing the potential of hearing an expansion within the first four measures highlights the accelerations in the harmonic rhythm in the rhythm of the first violin's melody in mm. 5-6.

The minuet's second part begins with a single eight-measure phrase that coordinates with four-measure hypermeter. When the first part of a Haydn minuet departs considerably from norms of phrase design and hypermeter, the start of the second part often brings a restoration of conventional structures.<sup>22</sup> Haydn recomposes the thematic rounding; it consists of sixteen measures, clearly divided into twelve measures plus a four-measure codetta. The twelve-measure span no longer suggests a 6 + 6 division. Instead, the surface hypermeter is 4 + 4 + 4 and the phrase design weakly articulates 8 + 4 within a single twelve-measure phrase. (A deceptive cadence can—rarely—end a phrase, but the submediant in m. 28 does not provide a phrase-ending cadence.) Particularly beautiful is the stepwise line from the C in m. 26 to the F in m. 30 that bridge the phrase's 8 + 4 division. The clear four-measure hypermeter and the expansion of the phrase length react to the stylistically marked structures of the opening and create large-scale metric process—even resolution—in the minuet.

<sup>22</sup> For other demonstrations of this principle, see Op. 20, No. 3 (minuet), Op. 54, No. 1 (minuet), Op. 64, No. 4 (trio), and Op. 76, No. 5 (trio).

## CONCLUSION

This article has argued for the necessity of intensive study of phrase rhythm in the undergraduate theory curriculum and has outlined one pedagogical approach. I have not probed all of the interesting possibilities within Haydn's minuets; a particularly ambitious instructor might explore at least three additional categories of minuets. First, several of the minuets from Haydn's string quartets begin with an unaccompanied melodic gesture significantly longer than the relatively common quarter-note upbeat. When these unaccompanied gestures span more than a measure, it can be unclear whether the first hyperdownbeat falls at the start of the first or the second notated measure. In some minuets this becomes a significant compositional feature that is skillfully prepared or rewritten at subsequent thematic returns. Minuets that incorporate extended upbeats include Op. 50, No. 5, Op. 71, No. 2, Op. 71, No. 3, and Op. 76, No. 3.<sup>23</sup> Second, a few movements explore unusual phrase lengths to a greater extent than seen above in Op. 64, No. 6. Five-measure phrases are a key element in the minuets of Op. 20, No. 3 and Op. 54, No. 1 and in the trio of Op. 64, No. 4. Study of these movements will stimulate discussion of the limits of hypermeter, although this topic will of course come up as one broadens out from the minuet repertoire. Third, there are a few minuets that are particularly willful in their use of hypermetric expansion and/or the rhythmic dissonance of duple grouping of beats. Perhaps the most metrically sophisticated of all of Haydn's minuets are those from Op. 33, No. 5, Op. 50, No. 4, Op. 77, No. 1, and Op. 77, No. 2.

---

<sup>23</sup> I explore these and other minuets in "Extended Upbeats in the Classical Minuet: Interactions with Hypermeter and Phrase Structure," *Music Theory Spectrum* 28, no. 1 (2006): 23-56.

Authors of composition manuals in the eighteenth century often used minuets to introduce composition. In our twenty-first century classrooms, minuets can still serve as pedagogical tools.<sup>24</sup> Haydn's minuets provide a corpus of music that allows one to demonstrate phrase rhythm as a meaningful aspect of a composition and to go beyond mere definitions of concepts like hypermeter and phrase expansion to reveal their musical effects.

---

<sup>24</sup> This is an opinion also expressed recently by Stefan Eckert in "'So, you want to write a Minuet?' Historical Perspectives in Teaching Theory," *Music Theory Online* 11, no. 2 (2005). Eckert draws on Mozart's earliest minuets and a treatise by Riepel to introduce students to composing minuets. As Eckert is designing introductory compositional exercises, his students write minuets that adhere strictly to four-measure hypermeasures. Such a compositional introduction to the basics of minuet writing would make excellent preparation for the more advanced analytic unit outlined in the present article.